

**MINUTES
REGULAR BOARD MEETING
THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 21, 2008, 9:00 A.M.**

Board Members Present at Roll Call: Les Abrams, Gabe Corral, Charlie Havranek, Myra Jefferson, Debbie Rudd. A quorum was present. Board Members Present after Roll Call: Rod Bolden. Board Members Absent: Cynthia Henry. Vacant Board Member Positions: Public; Certified Residential Appraiser.

Also Present at Roll Call: Debb Pearson, Executive Director; Beckie Loar, Regulatory Compliance Administrator; Jeanne Galvin, Assistant Attorney General; Also Present after Roll Call: Tanja Shipman, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office.

Les Abrams acted as Chairperson.

The Board pledged allegiance to the flag of the United States of America.

Debbie Rudd moved that the Minutes of the January 17, 2008, Regular Board Meeting, as amended, be approved. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Minutes of the January 31, 2008, Telephonic Special Board Meeting be approved. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

PUBLIC ANNOUNCEMENTS AND CALL TO PUBLIC

Marilyn Hinrichs filed a Call to Public and spoke to the Board concerning complaint 2403. Julie Friess, Certified Residential Appraiser # 20957, filed a Call to Public and spoke to the Board concerning repeat offenders.

Rod Bolden joined the meeting.

COMPLAINT REVIEW

Informal Hearing Concerning 2385/2386/2387/2388/2389/2390/2391, William H. Moffett.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board's questions. Corey Richtor, Esq., represented Respondent. Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH) alleging Level V violations. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2537, David M. Hossfeld.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2418, Lance R. Freeman.

Respondent and Michael T. Denious, Esq., appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board not accept Respondent's counteroffer. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that Respondent be given 14 days to sign the originally offered Consent Agreement and Order of Discipline; or the matter be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

Review and Action Concerning 2403, Safa P. Sitto.

Respondent and Marilyn Hinrichs, complainant's sister, appeared. Gabe Corral moved that the Board go into Executive Session for legal advice. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Upon return from Executive Session, the Board took no action concerning complainant's request for rehearing based on complainant's lack of jurisdiction. Charlie Havranek moved upon the Board's own motion, that the matter be reconsidered. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2426, Ray F. Griego.

Respondent and David Mowery, trainee, appeared, were sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board's questions. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Probation citing the violations and providing for probation, mentorship and education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2433/2446/2447, Michelle L. Hanke.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board's questions. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Probation citing the violations and providing for probation, mentorship and education. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2462/2463/2464/2465/2466/2467/2468/2469, Shawkat E. Halabu.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find the violations set out in the investigative report with exceptions. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Probation citing the violations and providing for probation, mentorship and education. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2444, Dawna Rogers.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board's questions. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Probation citing the violations and providing for probation, mentorship and education. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2493, Dawna Rogers.

Respondent appeared. Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be tabled to allow Respondent to furnish proof of the required remedial education; and that upon receipt of the proof, the complaint be closed. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2420/2482, Jill A. Trompeter.

Respondent appeared. Charlie Havranek moved that the matters be tabled to allow the assistant attorney general to research the matter. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2278, Safa P. Sitto.

Respondent appeared. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board deny Respondent's request for termination of mentorship and probation; and that the matter be reviewed in three months. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2504, Iver A. Bowden.

Respondent appeared. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board go into Executive Session for legal advice. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Upon return from Executive Session, Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of concern citing the violations. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek abstained.

Review and Action Concerning 2520/2523, William A. Buehl.

Respondent appeared. Staff summaries were read. Charlie Havranek moved that the matters be tabled to allow for settlement negotiations. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2521/2524, Ben B. Boothe.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summaries were read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Voluntary Surrender. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2522/2525, Barbara S. Bloomberg.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summaries were read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board issue Respondent a cease and desist letter with a copy to the Texas Appraiser Licensing and Certification Board and the Appraisal Institute. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Myra Jefferson left the meeting. A quorum remained. Tanja Shipman, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office, joined the meeting.

Review and Action Regarding Issues Dealing With Formal Hearing Concerning 08F-20522-BOA (2280//2281/2282/2283/2284/2285/2286/2287/2288/2289/2290/2291/2292/2293/2294/2295/2296/2297/2298/2299/2300/2301, Kym R. Gaudette.

Respondent appeared and was represented by Andrew D. Lynch, Esq. Jeanne Galvin, Assistant Attorney General, represented the State. Tanja Shipman, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office, advised the Board. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the proposed Consent Agreement and Order citing violations and providing for suspension, probation, mentorship and education. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted 3-0 in favor of the motion. Gabe Corral voted no. Debbie Rudd abstained. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board vacate the formal hearing scheduled before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Regarding Issues Dealing With Formal Hearing Concerning 07F-2321-BOA (2321), Thomas J. Dozier.

Respondent did not appear. Jeanne Galvin, Assistant Attorney General, represented the State. Tanja Shipman, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office, advised the Board. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board deny Respondent's request for rehearing. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2501, Thomas J. Dozier.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be referred to an investigator. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Tanja Shipman left the meeting.

Review and Action Concerning 2562, Thomas J. Dozier.

Respondent did not appear. Gabe Corral moved that the Board go into Executive Session for legal advice. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Upon return from Executive Session, Charlie Havranek moved that the Board withdraw its motion opening the complaint. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2452/2457, Dana A. Miller.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board's questions. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Probation citing the violations and providing for probation, mentorship and education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted 4-1 in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek voted no.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2453, Jaime Topete.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Probation citing the violations and providing for probation, mentorship and education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2470, Paul F. Devries.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board's questions. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Probation citing the violations and providing for probation, mentorship and education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2508, Theodore R. Wall/2509, Timothy N. Morrison.

Respondents and trainee, Randall Clemson, appeared, were sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board's questions. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Level I violations concerning 2508 and issue Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing the violations and providing for remedial education; and that the Board find Level II violations concerning 2509 and offer Respondent a due diligence consent letter citing violations and providing for disciplinary education. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2302, Michael D. Schendel.

Respondent did not appear but was represented by Shawn L. Stone, Esq. Upon its 12-month file review, Charlie Havranek moved that the Board reoffer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing revised violations and providing for revised remedial education. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board rescind its referral to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2497, Michael D. Schendel.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning Superior Court Case CV-06-4140 (03F-1782-BOA/03F-1784-BOA), Felicia M. Coplan.

Respondent did not appear. Jeanne Galvin updated the Board with the status of Respondent's appeal.

Review and Action Concerning 2421, Michelle T. Caraballo.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board table the matter and return the investigative report to the investigator for correction of typographical errors. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2428, Douglas E. Grever.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2434, Thomas M. Kittelmann.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2436, Vernon L. Stutzman.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a due diligence consent letter citing the violations and requiring disciplinary education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2477, Robert L. VanDyke.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the investigative report with the addition of violations. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2488, Richard A. Webb.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board table the matter to allow the Assistant Attorney General to follow-up in the matter. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2502, Clare A. Williamson-Redding.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2503, Randall P. Jacobs.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board go into Executive Session for legal advice. The motion failed for the lack of a second. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2263, Everett L. Quinn.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that, because Respondent's 90-day renewal grace period had expired, the complaint be closed to be reopened and considered in the event Respondent reapplies. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The motion was withdrawn. Gabe Corral moved that the matter be tabled to allow the assistant attorney general to research the matter. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2494, Eugene C. Rowe.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the complaint be closed based on Respondent's Consent Agreement for Voluntary Surrender of Certificate #20677 to be reopened and considered if Respondent reapplies. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2225, Joshua Hernandez.

Respondent did not appear. Upon the Board's 12-month file review, staff was instructed to proceed with the formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

Review and Action Concerning 2280/2281/2282/2283/2284/2285/2286/2287/2288/2289/2290/2291/2292/2293/2294/2295/ 2296/2297/2298/2299/2300/2301, Kym R. Gaudette.

Respondent did not appear. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board noted that the matter had previously been resolved earlier in the meeting.

Review and Action Concerning 2533, Clinton C. Clemson.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to an investigator. The motion was withdrawn. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Level I violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing violations and providing for remedial education. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2534, Alan A. Gilmore.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that, based on Respondent's Consent Agreement of Voluntary Surrender of Certificate #21043, the complaint be closed to be reopened and considered if Respondent reapplies. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2511, Marc L. Arnowitz.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board reconsider its prior motion to subpoena additional information. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2535, Stephanie E. Bourlier.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board issue Respondent a cease and desist letter. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2539, Laura J. Kokot.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board refer the matter to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2549, Dennis R. Willson.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2551, Alice R. Buell.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Staff was instructed to place discussion concerning the use of voluntary investigators on the next agenda.

Review and Action Concerning 2552, Pamela N. Plew.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2556, Paul J. Oken.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Level I violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of concern citing violations. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

BOARD CHAIRPERSON REPORT

Les Abrams announced the Committee Assignments and Committee Chairpersons.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT

Debb Pearson reported on the status of the Assistant Attorney General's assignments; advised the complaint answer dates that had been extended by staff; reported the following complaint statistics as of 1/31/08 for calendar years 2006, 2007, and 2008:

	<u>2006</u>	<u>2007</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2007</u>	<u>2008</u>
Complaints received by Board	209	243	13		
Complaints heard by Board				619	85
<u>OF THOSE COMPLAINTS:</u>					
Complaints dismissed	73	86	0	98	8
Complaints referred to investigation	84	78	0	116	3
Complaints resolved with nondisciplinary letter of concern	30	15	0	20	1
Complaints resolved with nondisciplinary letter of remedial action	11	14	0	18	2
Complaints resolved with disciplinary letter of due diligence	6	8	0	9	1
Complaints resolved with probation	31	19	0	44	1
Complaints referred to informal hearing	67	47	0	79	11
Complaints referred to formal hearing	39	7	0	32	9
Complaints resolved with suspension	6	3	0	4	0
Complaints resolved with surrender	2	1	0	2	0
Complaints resolved with revocation	1	4	0	4	1
Complaints resolved with cease and desist letters	24	3	0	4	1
<u>Violation Levels:</u>					
I	35	19	0	25	1
II	11	22	0	23	5
III	22	17	0	41	0
IV	4	4	0	6	0
V	10	4	0	5	0

Additional Information:

	<u>2005</u>	<u>2006</u>	<u>2007</u>	<u>2008</u>
Jurisdiction Expired & Complaints Closed	21	20	9	0
Denials of New Applications	5	7	7	2
Denials of Renewal Applications	2	4	1	0

updated the Board concerning the 2008 national examination; and reported on the 2/7/08 Mortgage Fraud Task Force meeting.

APPLICATION REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT

Debbie Rudd reported the following Arizona appraiser and property tax agent information as of February 20, 2008:

	<u>2/06</u>		<u>2/07</u>		<u>2/08</u>
Licensed Residential	938		1091		1032
Certified Residential	859		981		1170
Certified General	767		768		800
Nonresident Temporary	93	Total 2657	41	Total 2881	30 Total 3032
Property Tax Agents	288		284		268

Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the Committee's recommendations (see attached). Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

APPRAISAL TESTING AND EDUCATION COMMITTEE REPORT

Charlie Havranek moved that the Board approve the revised Applications for Course Approval. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the Committee's recommendations (see attached). Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

OLD BUSINESS

Discussion and Action Concerning Proposed Rulemaking Amending Title 4, Professions and Occupations, Chapter 46, Board of Appraisal, Article 1, General Provisions, Section R4-46-101, Definitions, and Article 2, Licensing and Certification, Section R4-46-201, Appraiser Qualification Criteria.

Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the changes recommended by the Governor's Regulatory Review Council's counsel, subject to grammatical, formatting or clarifying changes by GRRC staff, as follows:

ARTICLE 1. GENERAL PROVISIONS

R4-46-101. Definitions

In these rules, unless the context otherwise requires:

- "Arizona or State Certified General Appraiser" No change
- "Arizona or State Certified Residential Appraiser" No change
- "Arizona or State Licensed Appraiser" No change
- "Appraisal Foundation" No change
- "Appraiser" No change
- "Board" No change
- "Board counsel" No change
- "Board staff" No change
- "Complaint" No change

"Consent agreement" No change
"Consulting assignment" No change
"Conviction" No change
"Course provider" No change
"Direct supervision" means that a supervising appraiser of a trainee is physically present to direct and oversee directing and overseeing the production of each appraisal assignment- and is personally and physically present during the entire inspection of each appraised property.
"Disciplinary action" No change
"Dismissal" No change
"Distance education" No change
"Due diligence" No change
"Formal complaint" No change
"Formal hearing" No change
"Informal hearing" No change
"Informational interview" No change
"Initial review" No change
"Investigation" No change
"Investigator" No change
"Jurisdictional criteria" No change
"Letter of concern" No change
"Letter of due diligence" No change
"Letter of remedial action" No change
"Mentor" No change
"Order" No change
"Party" No change
"Practicing appraiser" No change
"Probation" No change
"Property tax agent" No change
"Remedial action" No change
"Respondent" No change
"Rules" No change
"Summary suspension" No change
"Supervising appraiser" No change
"Trainee" No change
"USPAP" No change
"Workfile" No change

ARTICLE 2. LICENSING AND CERTIFICATION

R4-46-201. Appraiser Qualification Criteria

A. Except as provided in subsections (B), (C), and (D), an applicant for the applicable classification of license or certificate shall meet that classification's criteria established by the Appraiser Qualifications Board (AQB) in either *The Real Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria and Interpretations of the Criteria* adopted February 16, 1994 effective January 1, 1998, ~~All Interpretations and Supplementary Information as of January 1, 2002, and Appendix I, Criteria Revisions effective January 1, 2003, ("1998 Criteria"), or The Real Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria adopted~~

~~January 1, 2003, All all Interpretations And Supplementary Information as of November 1, 2005, and Appendix, Real Property Qualifications Effective January 1, 2008 ("2008 Criteria");~~ The Real Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria and Interpretations of the Criteria (Real Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria adopted February 16, 1994, effective January 1, 1998; Includes all Interpretations and Supplementary Information as of January 1, 2002; Appendix I Criteria Revisions effective January 1, 2003) referred to as the "1998 Criteria", or The Real Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria and Interpretations of the Criteria (Real Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria Effective January 1, 2008; Appendix, Real Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria Prior to January 1, 2008; Includes All Interpretations and Supplementary Information as of February 1, 2007) referred to as the "2008 Criteria", as follows:

1. The requirements are divided into three components: education, experience and examination. An applicant shall meet the criteria in effect at the time the applicant completes a particular component.

2. The Board shall give credit for completion of a component if the applicant meets either the 1998 Criteria or the 2008 Criteria for any component completed prior to January 1, 2008.

3. The Board shall give credit for completion of a component only if the applicant meets the 2008 Criteria for any component completed on or after January 1, 2008.

4. On and after November 1, 2008, an applicant shall meet the 2008 Criteria for all components, regardless of when the component was completed. Both the 1998 Criteria and the 2008 Criteria are incorporated by reference and are on file with the Board. These incorporated criteria include no future ~~additions~~ editions or amendments. A copy of the incorporated criteria may be obtained from the Board or The Appraisal Foundation, 1155 15th Street, NW, Suite 1111, Washington, DC 20005; (202) 347-7722; fax (202) 347-7727; or website www.appraisalfoundation.org.

B. Regardless of whether a transaction is federally related:

1. A State Licensed Residential Appraiser is limited to the scope of practice in A.R.S. § 32-3612(A)(3), and

2. A State Certified Residential Appraiser is limited to the scope of practice in A.R.S. § 32-3612(A)(2).

C. Notwithstanding the criteria incorporated by reference in subsection (A),

1. An applicant shall not obtain more than 75% of required qualifying education through distance education,

2. An applicant shall not obtain the 15-hour National USPAP Course, or its equivalent, approved through the AQB Course Approval Program, through distance education, ~~and~~

3. Qualifying education credit may be obtained at any time before the date of application, except the 15-hour National USPAP Course or its AQB approved equivalent ~~must~~ shall be obtained within two years preceding the date of application; and

4. 75% of the applicant's quantitative experience requirements shall include work product where the applicant inspected the subject property.

D. Notwithstanding the criteria incorporated by reference in subsection (A), there is no Trainee Real Property Appraiser Classification.

1. A supervising appraiser shall instruct and directly supervise a trainee for

any classification of license or certificate in the entire preparation of each appraisal. The supervising appraiser shall approve and sign all final appraisal documents- certifying the appraisals are in compliance with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice. A supervising appraiser and trainee shall work in the same state and the supervising appraiser shall personally and physically supervise the entire inspection of each appraised property with the trainee. ~~To demonstrate responsibility for the instruction, guidance, and direct supervision of the trainee, the supervising appraiser shall:~~

- a. ~~Sign the appraisal report and certify the report is in compliance with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice,~~
- b. ~~Personally supervise the entire physical inspection of each appraised property with the trainee, and~~
- c. ~~Review and sign each trainee appraisal report.~~

2. A trainee may have more than one supervising appraiser, but a supervising appraiser shall not supervise more than three trainees at any one time. A trainee shall maintain an appraisal log for each supervising appraiser and, at a minimum, include the following in the log for each appraisal:

- a. Type of property,
- b. Date of report,
- c. Property description,
- d. Description of work performed by the trainee and scope of review and supervision by the supervising appraiser,
- e. Number of actual work hours by the trainee on the assignment, and
- f. The signature and state certificate number of the supervising appraiser. ~~This subsection (D)(2)(f) is effective January 1, 2008.~~

3. ~~A supervising appraiser and trainee shall work in the same geographic area, and in no event shall the supervising appraiser and trainee work in different states.~~

4. ~~3. A supervising appraiser shall provide to the Board in writing the name and address of each trainee within 10 days of engagement, and notify the Board in writing immediately upon termination of the engagement. A state certified appraiser is not eligible to be a supervising appraiser unless the appraiser's certificate is in good standing and the appraiser has not been subject to license or certificate suspension, probation, or mentorship within the last two years. This subsection (D)(4) is effective January 1, 2008.~~

4. An appraiser who wishes to act as a supervising appraiser shall submit proof of completion of a minimum of 4 hours of continuing education approved by the Board, regarding the role of a supervising appraiser, before supervision begins. The required course shall not be taken through distance education.

5. All supervising appraisers shall submit to the Board proof of completion of a minimum of 4 hours of continuing education approved by the Board regarding the role of a supervising appraiser within 60 days of the effective date of this subsection (D)(5). The required course shall not be taken through distance education. If the supervising appraiser does not take the course within 60 days of the effective date of this subsection (D)(5), the supervising appraiser may no longer act as a supervising appraiser until the class is taken and proof has been submitted to the Board.

4-6. In the event that an appraiser (who wishes to act as a supervising appraiser) or a supervising appraiser does not comply with the requirements of this subsection (D):

a. The appraiser (who wishes to act as a supervising appraiser) or the supervising appraiser may be subject to disciplinary action pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-3631(A)(8), and

b. The trainee shall not receive experience credit for all hours logged during the period that the supervising appraiser or appraiser (who wishes to act as a supervising appraiser) has failed to comply with the requirements of this subsection (D).

that the rules have a regular 60-day effective date from filing with the Secretary of State rather than a delayed effective date; and that staff proceed with the finalization of the rulemaking package. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

NEW BUSINESS

Discussion and Action Concerning Expiring License and Certificate Applications and the 2008 National Uniform Examination.

Charlie Havranek moved that the Board go into Executive Session for legal advice. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Upon return from Executive Session, Charlie Havranek moved that to allow the Appraiser Qualifications Board and PEARSON Vue the required time to determine the cut score and adjust the examinations, all applicants currently approved to take the examination be granted an additional 100 days to complete their applications. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Regarding the Board's Reliance on the National Registry for Discipline and the Elimination of the Requirement of Letters of Good Standing/History Letters in Appraiser Applications.

Charlie Havranek moved that the Board rely on the National Registry to track discipline and eliminate the requirement of copies of certificates and letters of good standing/history letters in appraiser applications effective retroactively to all pending applications. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Concerning a Response on Behalf of the Board to the Appraisal Standards Board (ASB) and Appraiser Qualifications Board (AQB) Invitation to Comment on USPAP and USPAP Education.

Charlie Havranek moved that Debbie Rudd furnish staff with a response to the Appraisal Standards Board (ASB) and Appraiser Qualifications Board (AQB). Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Concerning Attendance on Behalf of the Board at the Appraiser Qualifications Board (AQB) meeting, the State Regulatory Advisory Group (SRAG), and the annual Spring Conference of the Association of Appraiser Regulatory Officials (AARO) to be held April 11-14, 2008, in San Francisco, California.

Charlie Havranek moved that Debb Pearson represent the Board at the meetings. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Concerning Advertisements by Landmark Appraisal Group.

Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be tabled due to time constraints. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Concerning Advertisements by Appraisers Dot Com.

Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be tabled due to time constraints. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Concerning Advertisements by Appraise All.

Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be tabled due to time constraints. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Concerning Advertisements by Phoenix Appraisal Network.

Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be tabled due to time constraints. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Concerning Enhanced Appraisal Requirements by Wells Fargo Home Mortgage.

Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be tabled due to time constraints. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

CONFIRMATION OF MEETING DATES, TIMES, LOCATIONS AND PURPOSES

The upcoming Committee and Board meetings were scheduled as follows:

March

19	Application Review Committee	9:00 a.m.
20	Appraisal Testing and Education Committee	7:30 a.m.
20	Board	9:00 a.m.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned.

/S/
Lester G. Abrams, Chairperson

**RECOMMENDATIONS
COMMITTEE ON APPLICATION REVIEW**

TO: Board of Appraisal

From: Application Review Committee

Date: February 21, 2008

Re: February 20, 2008 Recommendations

I. Report on number of Arizona Appraisers and Property Tax Agents:

	<u>2/06</u>		<u>2/07</u>		<u>2/08</u>
Licensed Residential	938		1091		1032
Certified Residential	859		981		1170
Certified General	767		768		800
Nonresident Temporary	93	Total 2657	41	Total 2881	30
Property Tax Agents	288		284		268

II. As a result of its February 20, 2008 meeting the Application Review Committee makes the following recommendations:

A. To approve the following applications as substantively complete:

1. Renewal applications:

11403 Timothy O. Schmitz

2. Licensed Residential by exam unless noted otherwise:

7075	Susan P. Smith
7109	John W. Downing
7151	Glenda R. Lawson
7152	Bridget R. Lundahl
7173	Martha A. Roush
7209	Marshall L. Martin
7233	Barbara L. Banis
7234	Patrick R. Murphy
7252	Debra C. Hume
7269	Scott W. Post
7282	Wayne L. Franke

7288 Gabriel J. Trevizo
7289 Kenneth Frazier
7300 Jeremiah Joncas
7315 Randall G. Fitzpatrick
7323 Ernesto Leal Elizondo
7334 Scott William Day

3. Certified Residential by exam unless otherwise noted:

6906 Teresa J. Wagner
6918 Matthew J. Burlando
6996 Richard D. Ellis
6971 Arturo G. Reeder
7026 David A Merrill
7072 John W. Garner
7080 Matthew B. Mullins
7086 Timothy L. Scheible
7090 Raymond R. Bluth
7095 Anna M. Birkett
7100 Steven P. Hanna
7112 Evan M. Spealman
7128 Kerry L. Bonham
7129 Michael A. Spencer
7132 Chris D. Schutza
7181 Julie A. Burdick
7192 Jan E. Greenhow
7199 Candice E. Boys
7212 Sandra A. Schiager
7216 Jayson M. Lundberg
7225 Angel Nevarez
7238 Christopher F. Jackson
7241 Shahrzad Tavakolzaden
7243 Bryan M. Woodyard
7254 Paul S. Watson
7280 Timothy A. Maze
7306 Bradley L. Evans
7312 Robert M. Wenzel, Jr.

4. Certified General by exam unless otherwise noted:

7022 Robert J. Sitter
7274 John L. Wyatt
7230 Gary G. Killinsworth
7285 Adam J. Wood
7313 Kyle R. Wood

B. To approve the following applications as substantively complete and confirm the issuance of the following license/certification:

1. Reciprocity

11970	Francisco J. Gutierrez
21877	Ronald L. Danielson
31600	Todd M. Deitemyer

2. Nonresident Temporary

TP41079	Steven M. Giannini
TP41080	John W. Van Santen
TP41081	Michael A. Chesney
TP41082	William R. Hopping
TP41083	William R. Hopping

C. To disapprove the following applications as substantively incomplete and hold until substantively complete:

6904	Patience S. Crayton
7097	Thomas R. Deluca
7200	Larry E. Roush
7314	Laurence J. O'Grady
7342	James C. Jasinski, Jr. (by reciprocity)

III. Applications Pending - Substantively Incomplete

6953	Daniel J. Kennedy (by reciprocity)
6998	Stephen Rich (by reciprocity)
7017	Michael J. Heaton
7027	Thomas E. Chambers
7085	Janet A. Defrancesco
7123	Todd S. Reiser
7156	Debra T. Miller
7207	Cherylann S. Bryant (by reciprocity)
7249	Trenton J. Beyer

Notification of applicants with substantively incomplete applications who have not responded to the Committee's request for additional information. Pursuant to R4-46-202(D) applicants have up to a year to meet all requirements for license/certificate or applicant's file is to be closed by the Board and applicant shall reapply.

RECOMMENDATIONS

COMMITTEE ON APPRAISAL TESTING AND EDUCATION

TO: Board of Appraisal

FROM: Committee on Appraisal Testing and Education

DATE: February 21, 2008

RE: February 21, 2008 Recommendations

As a result of its February 21, 2008 meeting the Committee on Appraisal Testing and Education makes the following recommendations:

- I. Action regarding requiring attendance at one Board meeting for all original appraiser applicants (Tabled from 8/07)

Tabled
- II. Action regarding approval of Applications for Course Approval consistent with R4-46-106(cost revisions) to become effective for applications received in the Board office on and after 3/8/08

Recommend approval
- III. Action regarding proposed approval of **qualifying education courses:**
 - A. **Previously approved by the Board:**
 1. Submitted by American Society of Farm Managers & Rural Appraisers
 - a. **A-101 Basic Appraisal Principles**, #ABA 0207-605-01 30 hours
*Scott Seely
Recommend approval
 2. Submitted by Appraisal Institute
 - a. **General Appraisers Sales Comparison Approach**, #ABA 0207-606-13
30 hours
*Mark Rattermann
Recommend approval

3. Submitted by Arizona School of Real Estate & Business
 - a. **Real Property Valuation 104-Part I**, #ABA 0901-027-02 30 hours
*Tracey Captain, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Kathleen Holmes, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, Roy Morris, Ronald Schilling, Daniel Smith, Rick Turkian, Gerard Vick, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
 - b. **Appraisal 103- General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use**, #ABA 0407-621-11 30 hours
*Tracey Captain, Earland Cass, Gasper Crimando, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Thomas P. Denny, Rick Fasano, Bill Gray, Kathleen Holmes, Robert Kaczmarek, Gretchen Koralewski, James Miller, Don Miner, Roy Morris, Becky Ryan, Ronald Schilling, Daniel Smith, Richard Turkian, Gerard Vick, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
4. Submitted by Best School Of Real Estate & Appraisal
 - a. **2008-2009 National USPAP**, #ABA 0804-365-03 15 hours
*Roy Morris, Daniel Smith
Recommend approval
5. Submitted by McKissock Appraisal School
 - a. **Residential Sales & Income Approaches**, #ABA D0207-607-06
Distance Education 30 hours
*Alan Simmons
Recommend approval

B. Not previously approved by the Board:

1. Submitted by Arizona School of Real Estate & Business
 - a. **AP-10A Comprehensive Road Map to Supervising Entry-Level Appraisers**, 20 hours
*Janes Adams, Tracey Captain, Earland Cass, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Michael Denious, Thomas Denny, Anthony Dinnell, Bill Dowdy, Richard Fasano, Bill Gray, Randy Helfman, Kathleen Holmes, Faye Humphrey, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, William Kozub, Mark Kramoltz, Don Miner, Roy Morris, Sherry Olsen, David Rider, Kevin Rude, Becky Ryan, Ronald Schilling
Recommend approval
 - b. **AP-10B Mastering Unique & Complex Property Appraisal**, 20 hours
*Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Thomas Denny, Richard Fasano, Bill Gray, Kathleen Holmes, Robert Kaczmarek, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, Don Miner, Roy Morris, Becky Ryan, Ronald Schilling, Daniel Smith, Rick Turkian, Gerard Vick, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
2. Submitted by McKissock Appraisal School
 - a. **Advanced Residential Applications & Case Studies**, 15 hours
Distance Education
*Alan Simmons
Recommend approval

- b. **Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best use**, 15 hours
Distance Education
*Ken Guilfoyle
Recommend approval

IV. Action regarding proposed approval of **continuing education courses**:

A. **Previously approved by the Board:**

- 1. Submitted by Acheson Appraisal Classes
 - a. **Plans and Specifications**, #ABA 0202-141 4 hours
*Ross Acheson, Robert Fabrizio, Daniel Smith
Recommend approval
 - b. **Appraising Manufactured Homes**, #ABA 1202-260 8 hours
*Andrew Anderson, Daniel Smith
Recommend approval
 - c. **FNMAE & ANSI Guidelines**, #ABA 0404-346 3 hours
*Ross Acheson, Robert Fabrizio, Daniel Smith
Recommend approval
 - d. **Adjustment Techniques**, #ABA 0404-347 4 hours
*Ross Acheson, Daniel Smith
Recommend approval
 - e. **Handling a Negative Review**, #ABA 0207-608 3 hours
*Ross Acheson, Robert Fabrizio, Daniel Smith
Recommend approval
 - f. **R.E.O. Appraisals**, #ABA 0207-609 3 hours
*Ross Acheson, Robert Fabrizio
Recommend approval
 - g. **Statistics & Market Trend Analysis**, #ABA 0207-610 4 hours
*Ross Acheson, Robert Fabrizio, Daniel Smith
Recommend approval
- 2. Submitted by American Society of Farm Managers & Rule Appraisers/ AZ Chapter
 - a. **Spring Ag Outlook Forum** #ABA 1206-325 6 hours
*Jay Butler, Charles Havranek, Maria Hyatt, Jeff Gross, John Skelly,
Greg Kornrumpf, Mary Rickert, Jim Rickert
Recommend approval
- 3. Submitted by Arizona School of Real Estate & Business
 - a. 1109 General Contractors Licensing Program, #ABA 0202-152 24 hours
*Neil Dauler-Phinney, Tom Denny, Dave Maza, Paul Rhodes, Larry
Schoenberger, Dan Smith
Recommend approval
 - b. **1088 Introduction to Contract Writing (Boot camp)**, #ABA 0202-153
6 hours
*James Amdahl, Linda Bechtel, Leo Canale, Randy Cooney, Bill Dowdy,
Diane Flannigan, Bill Gray, Colleen Gunderson, Fay Humphrey, Bob
Kaczmarek, Catherine Kuhn, Marge Lindsay, Don Miner, Marlene Olsen,

Paulie Parouse, Dave Rider, Becky Ryan, Shirley Scully, Barry Seip, Nancy Smith, Pam Smith, Richard Turkian, John Wenner, James Zirbes, Roberta Burleson

Recommend approval

- c. **1110 General Contractors Plans & Material Take-offs, #ABA 0202-154** 4 hours
*Neil Dauler-Phinney, Tom Denny, Dave Maza, Paul Rhodes, Larry Schoenberger, Dan Smith
Recommend approval
- d. **1107 General Contractors Concrete & Steel, #ABA 0302-154** 4 hours
*Tom Denny, Dave Maza, Paul Rhodes, Larry Schoenberger, Dan Smith
Recommend approval
- e. **1108 General Contractors Masonry & Wood Framing, #ABA 0302-155** 4 hours
*Neil Dauler-Phinney, Tom Denny, Dave Maza, Paul Rhodes, Larry Schoenberger, Dan Smith
Recommend approval
- f. **1112 General Contractors Business Management II, #ABA 0302-156** 4 hours
*Neil Dauler-Phinney, Tom Denny, Dave Maza, Paul Rhodes, Larry Schoenberger, Dan Smith
Recommend approval
- g. **1113 General Contractors Business Management I, #ABA 0302-157** 4 hours
*Neil Dauler-Phinney, Tom Denny, Dave Maza, Paul Rhodes, Larry Schoenberger, Dan Smith
Recommend approval
- h. **1968 Appraisal Valuation & Current Economic Trends, #ABA 0302-164** 4 hours
*Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Rick Fasano, Kathleen Holmes, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, Roy Morris, Ronald Schilling, Daniel Smith, Gerard Vick, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
- i. **2065 How to Appraise Leasehold Interest, #ABA 0302-165** 4 hours
*Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Rick Fasano, Kathleen Holmes, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, Roy Morris, Ronald Schilling, Daniel Smith, Gerard Vick, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
- j. **3200 Appraising Property in Condemnation, #ABA 0302-167** 4 hours
*Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Rick Fasano, Bill Gray, Kathleen Holmes, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, Roy Morris, Ronald Schilling, Daniel Smith, Gerard Vick, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
- k. **2082 Environmental Problems & Their Effect on Land Values, #ABA 0502-215** 3 hours
*Earland Cass, Rick Fasano, Kathleen Holmes, Kim Kobriger, Don Miner, Roy Morris, Ronald Schilling, Daniel Smith, Richard Turkian, Gerard Vick, David Ziegler
Recommend approval

- l. **1254 Appraising Income Producing Property, #ABA 0502-216** 4 hours
*Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Rick Fasano, Kathleen Holmes, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, Roy Morris, Ronald Schilling, Daniel Smith, Gerard Vick
Recommend approval
- m. **2104 Real Estate Feasibility Study, #ABA 0502-217** 3 hours
*Tracey Captain, Earland Cass, Gasper Crimando, Michael Denious, John Faramelli, Rick Fasano, Bill Gray, Kathleen Holmes, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, David Maza, Don Miner, Roy Morris, Ronald Schilling, Larry Schoenberger, Daniel Smith, Stan Strom, Richard Turkian, Gerard Vick, David Wood, Jeff Young, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
- n. **C6139 Survival Guide to Home Inspection, #ABA 0903-299** 3 hours
*Anthony Dinnell, Jim Duke, Gary Kiggins, Dave Maza, Larry Schoenberger, Ronald Schilling, Dan Smith
Recommend approval
- o. **C6216 Arizona Construction Law, #ABA 0104-329** 3 hours
*Neil Dauler-Phinney, Tom Denny, Dan Kloberdanz, Kim Kobriger, Bill Kozub, Mark Kramoltz, Don Miner, Dan Smith
Recommend approval
- p. **C6505 Appraising Manufactured Housing, #ABA 0404-356** 7 hours
*Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, Roy Morris, Ronald Schilling, Daniel Smith, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
- q. **C7115 Uniform Residential Appraisal Report, #ABA 0605-431** 7 hours
*Gasper Crimando, Rick Fasano, Kim Kobriger, Roy Morris, Ronald Schilling, Daniel Smith, Gerard Vick, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
- r. **C4743 1031 Exchanges/Advanced Structures & Issues, #ABA 0306-513** 3 hours
*Karin Church, James Miller, Dave Tornell, Jeff Young
Recommend approval
- s. **1237 Zoning Regulations, #ABA 0306-514** 3 hours
*James Adams, John Faramelli, William Gray, Kim Kobriger, Mike Phalen, Stan Strom, Rick Turkian, Gerard Vick, Dave Wood.
Recommend approval
- t. **3247 Commercial Contract Writing, #ABA 0306-515** 3 hours
*Joseph Chandler, Michael Denious, Bill Dowdy Terry Foster, Bill Gray, Randy Helfman, Charles King, Dan Kloberdanz, Bill Kozub, Mark Kramoltz, Greg McGill, Don Miner, Jeff Pitcher, Dave Rider, Stan Strom, Rick Turkian, Dave Wood
Recommend approval
- u. **3248 The Vacant Land Contract, #ABA 0306-516** 3 hours
*Michael Denious, Bill Dowdy Terry Foster, Bill Gray, Randy Helfman, Charles King, Dan Kloberdanz, Bill Kozub, Kim Kobriger, Mark Kramoltz, Greg McGill, Don Miner, Mitch Mitchell, Marlene Olson, Dave Rider, Rick Turkian
Recommend approval

- v. **3854 Arizona Land Development**, #ABA 0306-517 3 hours
*James Adams, Anthony "Clyde" Dinnell, John Faramelli, William Gray, Kim Kobriger, Dave Maza, Don Miner, Mike Phalen, Stan Strom, Rick Turkian, Gerard Vick, Dave Wood.
Recommend approval
- w. **4140 Land Development 101**, #ABA 0306-518 3 hours
*James Adams, Anthony Dinnell, John faramelli, Bill Gray, Kim Kobriger, David Maza, Don Miner, Michael Phalen, Stan Strom, Rick Turkian, Gerared Vick, Dave Wood.
Recommend approval
- x. **Condominiums, Co-ops, and PUDs**, #ABA 1106-593 7 hours
*Gasper Crimando, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, Roy Morris, Daniel Smith, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
- y. **C8347 Loan Fraud and Other Factors Impacting Residential Real Estate**, #ABA 0407-627 3 hours
*Gasper Crimando, Rick Fasano, Roy Morris, Sherry Olsen, Daniel Smith, Don Spongberg, Fletcher Wilcox, Gerard Vick, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
- z. **1111 General Contractors Plaster, Stucco & Mathematics**, #ABA 0202-155 4 hours
*Neil Dauler-Phinney, Tom Denny, Dave Maza, Paul Rhodes, Larry Schoenberger, Dan Smith
Recommend approval
- aa. **3906 Home Inspection & the Real Estate Industry**, #ABA 0203-272 4 hours
*Lamont Bawden, Earl Cass, Thomas Denny, Anthony Dinnell, James Duke, Willima Fisher, William Gray, Hos Hoskins, Gary Kiggins, David Maza, Don Miner, Paul Rhodes, Becky Ryan, Scott Rychener, Ronald Schilling, Larry Schoenberger, Daniel Smith, Stan Strom, Rick Turkian, Kim Kobriger
Recommend approval
- 4. Submitted by Best School of Real Estate & Appraisal
 - a. **Seller Property Disclosure**, #ABA 0202-157 3 hours
*Stuart Bernstein
Recommend approval
 - b. **What's Fair (. . . about Fair Housing)?** #ABA 0202-158 3 hours
*Stuart Bernstein, Dawn Sicher
Recommend approval
 - c. **Leases and Valuation of Partial Interests**, #ABA 0306-507 3 hours
*Roy E. Morris III
Recommend approval
- 5. Submitted by Foundation of Real Estate Appraisers
 - a. **Advanced Issues in Appraising**, #ABA D0207-611 Distance Education 22 hours
*Ross Acheson
Recommend approval

6. Submitted by Kinja, LLC
 - a. **Identify & Prevent Real Estate Fraud**, #ABA 0107-603 6 hours
*Richard Hagar
Recommend approval
7. Submitted by Hogan School of Real Estate
 - a. **1031 Tax Deferred Exchanges in Today's Market**, #ABA 1001-045 3 hours
*Bardley Horton
Recommend approval
 - b. **Highest and Best Use Analysis for Residential Properties**, #ABA 0102-110 3 hours
*Steven Cole
Recommend approval
 - c. **Pricing Small Apartments**, #ABA 0102-111 3 hours
*Steven Cole
Recommend approval
 - d. **Mold! & Other Furry Subjects**, #ABA 0203-268 3 hours
*Michael Kazz
Recommend approval
 - e. **Disclosure: The Practical Guide**, #ABA 0203-270 3 hours
*James Hogan
Recommend approval
 - f. **Planning & Zoning Made Simple**, #ABA 1206-600 3 hours
*Alex Kimmelman
Recommend approval
8. Submitted by Training Team Center
 - a. **The Relocation Appraisal – Understand the Process**, #ABA 1107-713 7 hours
*Jay Delich
Recommend approval

B. Not previously approved by the Board:

1. Submitted by Acheson Appraisal Classes
 - a. **Choosing the Best Comparables**, 3 hours
*Ross Acheson, Daniel Smith, Robert Fabrizio
Recommend approval
 - b. **Condo's & Small Units**, 3 hours
*Ross Acheson, Daniel Smith, Robert Fabrizio
Recommend approval
 - c. **Land Appraisals**, 3 hours
*Ross Acheson, Daniel Smith, Robert Fabrizio
Recommend approval
 - d. **Retrospective & Prospective Appraisals**, 3 hours
*Ross Acheson, Daniel Smith, Robert Fabrizio
Recommend approval

- e. **The Appraisal Institute Residential Form**, 3 hours
*Ross Acheson, Daniel Smith, Robert Fabrizio
Recommend approval
- 2. Submitted by Appraisal Institute
 - a. **Appraising Challenges: Declining Markets & Sales Concessions**, 7 hours
*Mark Rattermann
Recommend approval
 - b. **Online Reviewing Residential Appraisals & Using Fannie Mae Form 2000**, 7 hours
Distance Education
*Mark Rattermann
Recommend approval
 - c. **REO Appraisal - Appraisal of Residential Property for Foreclosure & Pre-Foreclosure**, 7 hours
*Mark Smeltzer
Recommend approval
- 3. Submitted by Appraisal Institute/ Phoenix Chapter
 - a. **Appraising For Alternative Uses: Life Beyond Lending**, 7 hours
*Dawn Molitor-Gennrich
Recommend approval
 - b. **Maintaining Control: Client Pressure, Appraisal Identity Theft & Appraisal Tampering**, 7 hours
*Dawn Molitor-Gennrich
Recommend approval
 - c. **Evaluating Commercial Construction**, 14 hours
*James Canestaro
Recommend approval
- 4. Submitted by Appraisal Mastery Center
 - a. **Course 421-Residential Appraisal Mastery, The "how to" URAR report writing and problem solving course, focusing on meeting the requirements of mortgage lender underwriting**, 16 hours
*David Ehrnstein
Recommend approval
 - b. **Course 422-Perfecting the URAR (FNMA Form 1004)**, 8 hours
*David Ehrnstein
Recommend approval
- 5. Submitted by Hogan School of Real Estate
 - a. **Pima County Real Estate Research Council Annual Meeting**, 3 hours
*James Hogan
Recommend approval

6. Submitted by Just Valuation Inc.
 - a. **2973 JVI Appraising Residential REO Properties**, 6 hours
Distance Education
*Ron Nation, Robert McKenna
Recommend approval
7. Submitted by M.A.E. Real Estate Education
 - a. **Developing and Reporting a Defensible 1004 Report (AP202)**, 8 hours
*John R. Ohlin
Recommend approval
8. Submitted by McKissock Appraisal School
 - a. **Even Odder: More Oddball Appraisals**, 7 hours
Distance Education
*Daniel Bradley
Recommend approval
9. Submitted by National Association of Independent Fee Appraiser/ Phoenix Chapter
 - a. **2008-2009 National USPAP Update**, 7 hours
*Danny Wiley
Recommend approval
10. Submitted by Training Team Center LLC
 - a. **Unleash the Data, Know Your Market Tools (RA-3)**, 3 hours
*Jay Delich
Recommend approval
11. Submitted by Wachovia Appraisal Training
 - a. **Construction to Permanent Appraisal Process**, 15 hours
*Rick Langdon, Kevin Wardrop, Al Pinto, Deon Layton, Jennifer Swope, Tom Perlinger, Rusty McLaughlin
Recommend approval

V. Action regarding proposed approval of instructor approval:

1. Submitted by International Right of Way Association, Chapter #73
 - a. Reviewing Appraisal in Eminent Domain, #410, #ABA 0108-732
(1) Sandra L. St. Arnauld
Recommend approval

VI. Action regarding proposed approval of continuing education credit:

1. Submitted by Arizona School of Real Estate & Business
 - a. Richard Fasano
 - (1) AP-01 Basic Appraisal Principles, #ABA 0906-569-01 8 hours
 - (2) AP-02 Basic Appraisal Procedures, #ABA 0906-570-02 8 hours
 - (3) AP-07 Residential Report Writing, #ABA 0906-571-07 4 hours
- Recommend approval for 14 hours